

**Michael Gehr, chair, called the meeting to order at 4:35 p.m. on Thursday, February 27, 2014, in the Conference Room, Fourth Floor, City Hall. A roster of the members of the commission and the technical posts they fill are on file and available upon request. Also present were commission members L. Allen, C. Davis, S. Dozier, V. Hrabal, P. Reed, S. Silas, and M. Wertman. S. Bockmiller, Development Planner/Zoning Administrator, was present on behalf of the Planning and Code Administration Division.**

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES: January 23, 2014.**

**MOTION:** (Silas/Wertman) Motion to adopt.  
**DISCUSSION:** None.  
**ACTION:** APPROVED (Unanimous)

**CONSENT AGENDA**

None.

**DESIGN REVIEW**

**926 Oak Hill Avenue – Robert E. Powell – Replacement Windows,  
Case No. HDC 2014-05.**

Robert E. Powell, 926 Oak Hill Avenue, Hagerstown, Maryland, was present.

Staff Report: This property is a B resource in the Oak Hill Local Historic District. The applicant is proposing to replace 25 one-over-one wood windows with one-over-one Window World vinyl replacement windows. Existing storm windows will be removed; all wood trim will be painted. None of the sills will be wrapped. Staff recommended approval and noted that the HDC approved this window model on a bungalow-style house on Hamilton Boulevard approximately two years ago. Given the architectural style and period of construction of the building, the one-over-one configuration without grilles is appropriate.

Applicant/Commission Discussion: Mr. Powell stated that the Victorian-style house was built in 1909. All windows are one-over-one and that is the configuration of the new windows. There were no comments by the commission.

**MOTION:** (Dozier/Silas) Mr. Chairman, I have inspected the project plans and the property in question, and if constructed in accordance with these plans, the project is compatible with the character of the district for the reasons that the windows that will be used will be one-over-ones replacing the one-

over-ones that have been there since the erection of the property for the reason that the windows are generally in harmony with Architectural Design Guidelines for the Residential Preservation Design Districts and the character of the adjoining properties. Therefore, I move that the HDC grant a Certificate of Appropriateness to the applicant for Case No. HDC 2014-05.

**DISCUSSION:** Mr. Gehr asked that the motion be modified to reflect that this is the Oak Hill Historic District.

**ACTION:** APPROVED (Unanimous)

**WORKSHOP:**

**115-117 South Potomac Street – Dr. Prasad Reddi – Windows and Doors.**

Mr. Bockmiller said this building is adjacent to St. John’s Lutheran Church. The building façade is covered with vinyl siding. Dr. Reddi would like guidance for replacing the windows and doors. The front windows are very visible from a public way and the guidelines are very clear on how they should be treated; however, the side of the building is not as clear cut. The windows and doors on the side are set back, in addition this façade is facing away from the flow of vehicular traffic.

Dr. Reddi and his contractor, Dale Ford, were present. Dr. Reddi stated that the windows and doors are deteriorated and need to be replaced. Mr. Gehr asked if all the windows will be replaced. Dr. Reddi stated that some of them are salvageable in the back. Mr. Ford added that the front windows have existing vinyl replacement windows, but he was not sure when they were installed. Some of the windows in the rear are also existing vinyl windows.

Mr. Bockmiller stated that the windows on the left of the front façade have a transom arrangement. One of them is used for a window air conditioning unit. There is a desire to replace the windows with ones that match those on the left so they can be used for window air conditioners. Given that it is a street level front façade, Mr. Bockmiller wanted the HDC to provide guidance. Mr. Ford added that the owner would like to replicate the first level window air conditioning units on the residential side (north side of the building). Dr. Reddi added that there is no other way to install air conditioning on that side of the building. Mr. Bockmiller said he advised the owner that if the commission agrees to two air conditioning units on the first floor, all of the windows should have the same configuration on the first floor for consistency. Mr. Bockmiller noted that normally the HDC does not regulate window air conditioners because they are not a permanent change to the building. However in this instance, the proposal is to modify the historic window configuration to allow for installation of a window air conditioning unit. The windows on the right are the original wood windows. Mr. Gehr pointed out that the windows on the right and the windows on the left do not match. The ones on the left are smaller

**Historic District Commission  
MINUTES**

**February 27, 2014  
City of Hagerstown, Maryland**

both in width and in height. Mr. Bockmiller noted that the guidelines recommend that the windows be replaced to the higher standard, especially in this instance since the façade is adjacent to the sidewalk. Dr. Reed added that the two wood windows on the lower right façade are the only remaining original material on the building, although the vinyl siding is probably covering original material. Dr. Reddi was not in favor of double-hung windows on the first floor for security reasons and would prefer to use fixed, single-pane windows with a transom similar to those on the left side.

Mr. Bockmiller asked Dr. Reed if it would be appropriate to retain one of the double-hung windows on the right side, and allow a fixed transom window for the air conditioner. Dr. Reed was in favor of saving one original wood window as an example of what was there originally.

Concerning the doors, Mr. Ford said they did not plan to do anything with the doors on the front except to remediate any lead paint issues. The second and third floor windows are already vinyl and they hope to upgrade the efficiency of the windows with the new replacements. Mr. Gehr noted that replacement of the upper floor and side and rear windows with vinyl one-over-ones is not an issue. On the side windows, the wood trim and arched tops should remain. The only concern is what type of treatment for the street level front windows. Ms. Hrabal asked if the air conditioning unit on the south side of the building could be moved to one of the side windows, however, that would not solve the issue of cooling residential units on the north side of the building.

Mr. Ford stated that they would also like to replace the rear doors with fiberglass, pre-hung units to eliminate the lead hazard and increase the energy efficiency for the doors on both levels on the side. There are also three doors on the back that may need to be replaced depending on their condition. Mr. Bockmiller noted that as long as the doors are a standard design (no oval or modern window openings, etc.), that these doors are set back far enough that their replacement should not be an issue. Mr. Ford noted there is a French door and asked the commission for advice on how to approach replacing this door, unless there is a door company that has a similar type door in a four-foot width. This door is located on the side under the porch. Mr. Ford summarized that the goal is to address security and energy efficiency issues and also lead paint remediation issues. Mr. Gehr concurred with staff's observation that the doors are located far enough back and are not visible from public ways. If they could replicate the existing doors as closely as possible that would be the ideal scenario.

Dr. Reed suggested keeping the wood windows on the north side, first floor and lowering the top sash to fit a window unit on a shelf at the top of the window. The top sash could be anchored so it does not move. She believed this would be a less expensive route than replacing the entire window. Commission members agreed that the windows on the north side first floor should remain wood, double-hung. The existing windows could be repaired to reduce air leakage. Mr. Ford stated that the windows on the south side are not slated for replacement. They will remain the fixed single pane, with transoms above.

Ms. Allen noted that when the vinyl siding was placed on the building, it created a situation where it makes it difficult to make congruent modifications to the building. The vinyl destroyed the whole appearance of the building. Mr. Gehr said it would be nice if the windows in the middle section could be opened back up. Mr. Ford stated that Dr. Reddi talked with the previous owner who said that to repair the brick under the vinyl siding would be cost prohibitive. Mr. Ford said he hasn't seen the condition of the brick. Dr. Reddi initially explored a façade grant through the City of Hagerstown, but they did not feel it was feasible to pursue the grant.

Mr. Bockmiller summarized the commission's recommendations:

- Doors on the rear and side – the commission could be flexible.
- Windows on the south side elevation – modern materials could be used, but the replacements need to replicate as closely as possible what is there. Windows will have half screens. (BF Rich, Cabernet Series with simulated divided lights). Wood trim to be preserved.
- Windows on the front of the building (upper stories) will be vinyl, one-over-one; half screens are acceptable. (BF Rich-Cabernet Series)
- Front windows, first floor – Mr. Ford and Dr. Reddi did not agree with the recommendation to replace the windows on the north side with double-hung windows. They were adamant about replacing the windows so they match what is on the south side (single-pane, fixed with a transom above). Staff recommended against using vinyl at the street level. The first floor windows on the right should be wood. Ms. Hrabal noted that by changing the configuration of the windows from double hung to fixed, the building is moving further away from its historic appearance. Mr. Gehr suggested an uneven sash arrangement so the top sash is shorter to allow for a transom for the air conditioning unit. The second window on the north side would match the window with the air conditioning unit.

Mr. Ford requested a written summary of the discussion. Mr. Bockmiller will send him an email.

**67 West Franklin Street – Mohammad Farokhzad – Replacement Windows.**

**49 Jonathan Street – Mohammad Farokhzad – Replacement Windows.**

Mr. Farokhzad was not present.

**NEW BUSINESS:**

- Mr. Bockmiller announced that David Gibney will be conducting a wood window repair workshop on Thursday, March 6, 7:00 p.m. in Room 407, City Hall, and encouraged

**Historic District Commission  
MINUTES**

**February 27, 2014  
City of Hagerstown, Maryland**

commission members to support Mr. Gibney's effort. Mr. Gibney contacted the City offering to host the workshop and the commission agreed to sponsor it several months ago. CLG training credits will be available.

**OLD BUSINESS:**

None.

**ANNOUNCEMENTS**

- Sally Dozier announced that this will be her last meeting. She has taken another job in Frederick that will not allow her to get back to Hagerstown in time for the meetings. She said she enjoyed her tenure on the commission.

**ADJOURN:** It was moved and seconded that the meeting adjourn.

4/10/2014  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Approved



\_\_\_\_\_  
Debra C. Calhoun – Secretary