

Michael Gehr, chair, called the meeting to order at 4:30 p.m. on Thursday, February 28, 2019, in the Conference Room, Fourth Floor, City Hall. A roster of the members of the commission and the technical posts they fill are on file and available upon request. Also present were commission members L. Allen, C. Crumrine, R. Powell, and S. Silas. S. Bockmiller, Development Planner/Zoning Administrator; and D. Calhoun, Secretary, were present on behalf of the Planning and Code Administration Department.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES: January 31, 2019.

MOTION: (Allen/Silas) So moved (to approve the minutes).
DISCUSSION: None.
ACTION: APPROVED (Unanimous)

Mr. Bockmiller asked if the commission would be willing to add a workshop for revisions to the previously approved application for 37 South Prospect Street. Commission members agreed to add the workshop for 37 South Prospect Street.

CONSENT AGENDA

None.

DESIGN REVIEW

None.

WORKSHOPS

The order of the agenda was revised to allow the Williamses window contractor to arrive (433 North Potomac Street).

Skip Tovornik – 37 South Prospect Street.

Staff reported that Skip Tovornik, owner and developer of the property, has run into difficulty with the carriage house renovations. The carriage house is a mostly historic structure and very visible from public ways (South Walnut Street and West Antietam Street). Mr. Tovornik received approval to convert the carriage house into two dwellings. Since then he discovered that the

carriage house is not structurally stable based on a report from his structural engineer, Dan Matonak. Mr. Tovornik is interested in guidance from the commission on how to rebuild the two-story brick section which is the portion of the building that is unstable. He has submitted a structural engineer's report from Dan Matonak.

Mr. Tovornik stated that the foundation leans out toward the alley and the Women's Club parking area. The underpinnings of the footings are failing. Also, the soft brick on the façade is flaking away.

Mr. Tovornik outlined his proposed revisions:

- Moving the two-story section from over the storage area on the south side to the area facing the Mansion House and the Women's Club.
- Adding shake shingle and fake stone elements which he believes will blend in with the Women's Club building next door and the Mansion House.
- Limestone to match foundation of the nearby cottage.
- The roof pitch on the garage was changed to a pitched roof with limestone on the sides.
- The garage area towards Antietam Street, bordering the alley, is a block structure that has a cracked foundation and needs to come down.
- The hip roof on the garage side will be changed to a gable roof.
- Cement board siding will be used.

According to Mr. Tovornik, the height of the renovated carriage house will blend with the Women's Club and the nearby cottage house. He added that the changes will be tucked back away and if viewed from South Walnut Street and West Antietam Street it will look the same. He will not be expanding the footprint of the building. Mr. Bockmiller was concerned that the proposed revisions will give the carriage house a modern look with no historical context with the rest of the property. Mr. Tovornik stated that they will have to dig up under the building and support the footings which could cause the building to fail.

Mr. Bockmiller stated that staff is most concerned about the northwest elevation (seen from Walnut Street) and the southwest elevations (seen from Antietam Street), which are the most visible. He suggested a brick veneer on the alley side. Mr. Gehr added that the two-story portion should also be brick veneer. Mr. Gehr also stated that the new garage doors should replicate what is used on the other three garage doors. The wood shake siding should be changed to brick veneer the entire way up the wall with a vent or decorative piece at the gable. The paired windows on the rear façade should be pulled apart so they are not mulled together. A small portion of wall should be exposed between the windows. A window should be added to the second floor on the alley side. Mr. Tovornik stated he could add windows on the second floor. Mr. Gehr suggested that a window could be centered on the second floor.

On the West Antietam Street façade, Mr. Tovornik agreed to use taller windows. Translucent glass could be used for the bathroom window. Mr. Bockmiller suggested that instead of the proposed gable roof on the garage, that the shed roof should be continued. Ms. Allen wanted to

make sure there were no other issues that might warrant more demolitions on this property. Mr. Tovornik said he had no engineering issues on the other buildings.

Mr. Tovornik will need to file a revised application for the changes discussed at this meeting.

433 North Potomac Street – Meredith and Ed Williams – Replacement Windows.

Meredith and Edward Williams, 433 North Potomac Street, Hagerstown, Maryland, owners of the property were present, along with a representative from Castle Windows, Mike Lucas.

Mr. Bockmiller explained that this workshop concerns the windows on the front façade of the residence. The proposed windows on the front do not have exterior muntins. Mr. Williams presented photographs of the building to illustrate the distance from North Potomac Street in order to differentiate this application from other applications. The solarium windows are not going to be replaced. All windows would be consistent. The sides and rear are not visible from public ways; those windows will not have the arch feature.

Mr. and Mrs. Williams said the biggest consideration was to make sure they found a model with the arch that was within their budget. The grids are internal; however, they believe that the distance from North Potomac Street is a mitigating factor that would allow them to use the proposed Castle windows. According to Mr. Lucas, the upper sash of the arched windows need to be fixed (single hung). The windows on the sides and rear will be double hung. Frames will be white.

Mr. Bockmiller noted that there are modern materials that could be made with external muntins and the arch. Mr. Lucas said Castle could make arched windows with the muntins in wood. However, the Williamses are concerned about the cost; wood windows only on the front would be \$30,000. Ms. Williams added that the examples of external grids that they have seen appear to be glued to the glass.

The existing windows have cracked panes of glass and the wood is dry rotted. The house had been converted to five apartments and the house took a beating during that period. The windows in one of the bedrooms are curved and the Williamses will not be able to replace those due to the cost.

Mr. Lucas gave a presentation on his sample window. In response to a question by the commission, he indicated that the widest interior grill is 15/16ths. Mr. Lucas pointed out that the upper right window in the attic is a casement window (two one-over-ones); however that is not available in an arched casement window. As a result that window will be changed to a single-hung window. Mr. Gehr suggested that the vertical muntin be tripled up to make it wider.

The Williamses conveyed their appreciation to the commission that they were willing to consider expanding the use of vinyl windows. They could not afford to replace even one face of the building in wood. Mr. Lucas noted there are vinyl windows on the home already.

The HDC was okay with the windows proposed. Ms. Allen stated that these windows could appear as exterior storm windows and the distance from North Potomac Street could be a mitigating factor. Taking into consideration what the owners have been trying to do in renovating the property, it could be a considerable hardship to require exterior muntins.

NEW BUSINESS

None.

OLD BUSINESS

None.

ANNOUNCEMENTS

- Mr. Gehr announced that Samantha Kreiger has decided to step away from the commission due to time commitments. The commission will be down a member until that vacancy is filled.
- Mr. Bockmiller informed the commission that Hager Mill on Mill Street has changed hands. It was purchased by the woman who renovated Ravenswood Mansion off of Frederick Street and received an HDC preservation award for her efforts. The new owner does not have any immediate plans for the building. Staff plans to work with the new owner since it is the last standing 18th century mill building in the City. It is not located in a local historic district.
- Mr. Bockmiller announced a Planning Commissioner's conference in Hagerstown on March 29 between 10:00 a.m. and 3:00 p.m. at the University System of Maryland-Hagerstown campus. HDC members have been invited to attend. There will be another one in October.
- Mr. Powell asked if the HDC has a position on the Fairgrounds Entrance Building. Mr. Bockmiller said the City owns the building, under an easement of the Maryland Historical Trust (MHT). MHT has brought the condition of the building to the attention of the City. It is a budgetary issue since the City does not know what to do with the building. There are structural issues due to water damage. The building also does not meet the current codes for floor loads.

**Historic District Commission
MINUTES**

**February 28, 2019
City of Hagerstown, Maryland**

ADJOURN

It was moved and seconded that the meeting adjourn (5:40 p.m.).

3/28/2019

Approved



Debra C. Calhoun – Secretary